How important are Southern Hemisphere wind changes for low glacial carbon dioxide?

A model study

T. Tschumi, F. Joos, and P. Parekh

Received 14 January 2008; revised 4 July 2008; accepted 14 August 2008; published 31 October 2008.

[1] The response of atmospheric CO2 to modifications in the strength and position of Southern Hemisphere westerlies is examined with the Bern3D ocean model. The model responds more sensitively to changes in the wind amplitude than to variations in latitudinal position. Depending on the model setup, a 50% reduction in wind strength leads to a CO2 drawdown of 3–34 ppm, while a 50% increase results in a rise of 10–24 ppm. A poleward shift of 5° lowers CO2 by 2–16 ppm whereas an equatorward shift of 5° induces a CO2 increase of 2–14 ppm. Physical and biological mechanisms equally contribute to the modeled changes in atmospheric CO2. Our results are in conflict with the hypothesis that Southern Hemisphere wind changes are responsible for the low atmospheric CO2 concentrations during glacial periods.

Citation: Tschumi, T., F. Joos, and P. Parekh (2008), How important are Southern Hemisphere wind changes for low glacial carbon dioxide? A model study, Paleoceanography, 23, PA4208, doi:10.1029/2008PA001592.

1. Introduction

[2] In spite of more than 20 years of research, the causes of glacial-interglacial fluctuations in atmospheric CO2 still remain an unresolved issue. Many potentially important mechanisms have been suggested [e.g., Archer et al., 2000a; Sigman and Boyle, 2000], but sparse paleodata and limitations of currently applied models impede an unequivocal identification of the relevant processes. It is well established, however, that the atmospheric CO2 variations are the result of the redistribution of carbon between the terrestrial, oceanic and atmospheric reservoirs.

[3] In this study, we focus on the role of the Southern Hemisphere westerly winds (SHW) in regulating the large-scale ocean circulation and the ocean's carbon storage capacity. Our goal is (1) to assess the sensitivity of the large-scale ocean circulation, implied biogeochemical changes and the response in atmospheric CO2 to a modified strength and position of the SHW and (2) to discuss their potential role in explaining glacial-interglacial CO2 fluctuations.

[4] Toggweiler et al. [2006] suggest that a feedback between SHW, ocean circulation and atmospheric CO2 is largely responsible for glacial-interglacial CO2 fluctuations. The proposed mechanism is based on the concept that the global large-scale overturning circulation can be split into two different regimes that occupy distinct domains in the ocean interior [Toggweiler et al., 2006, Figure 3]. Their northern regime corresponds to the “biologically productive Northern Atlantic circuit,” i.e., the domain of AABW (Antarctic Bottom Water). Sinking organic particles are remineralized at depth in both circuits. When the water of the southern circuit comes up to the surface in the Southern Ocean (SO) today, the remineralized carbon escapes fairly easily to the atmosphere. In contrast, relatively little remineralized carbon escapes from the surface waters of the biologically productive northern circuit since biological production draws down surface pCO2.

[5] Toggweiler et al.‘s [2006] view of the glacial ocean is a scenario where the northern circuit remains active while the southern circuit is weak leading to a buildup of respired CO2 in the deep ocean and to less CO2 outgassing from the SO. In their hypothesis, Toggweiler et al. [2006] attach critical importance to the position of the SHW. They argue that the glacial SHW were equatorward of their present position such that upwelling next to Antarctica was suppressed and the southern circuit was essentially shut off during glacial times.

[6] Several recent studies show that SH winds modify large-scale overturning and air-sea CO2 fluxes in the SO on decadal time scales. Observations and models indicate a poleward intensification in the SHW during recent decades [Thompson and Solomon, 2002; Gillett and Thompson, 2003], which has resulted in an enhanced wind-driven upwelling around Antarctica [Russell et al., 2006; Lovenduski and Gruber, 2005; Hall and Visbeck, 2002]. Lovenduski et al. [2007] propose that this has led to an anomalous uptake of anthropogenic CO2 but to an even larger anomalous outgassing of natural CO2 over the SO. Therefore, higher stabilization levels of atmospheric CO2 would have to be expected on a multicentury time scale if the trend persists in the future [Le Quéré et al., 2007].

[7] In this study, we will revisit Toggweiler’s glacial-interglacial hypothesis testing its feasibility in the Bern3D coarse-resolution model [Müller et al., 2006; Parekh et al.,...
TSCHUMI ET AL.: SOUTHERN OCEAN WINDS AND ATMOSPHERIC CO₂

Table 1. Different Model Setups*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Setup</th>
<th>( F_{\text{at-Pac}} ) (Sv)</th>
<th>( \kappa_{\text{dia}} ) ((10^{-3} \text{ m}^2 \text{s}^{-1}))</th>
<th>BC</th>
<th>CEE (%)</th>
<th>NUE (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RBC</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>restoring</td>
<td>73.8</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weakFw</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>standard</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>strongFw</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBC lowdiff</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>restoring</td>
<td>80.9</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weakFw lowdiff</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>80.8</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lowdiff</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>79.3</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>strongFw lowdiff</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>78.3</td>
<td>13.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The amount of the Atlantic to Pacific freshwater flux \( F_{\text{at-Pac}} \), the value of diapycnal diffusivity \( \kappa_{\text{dia}} \) and the boundary conditions (BC) employed along with simulated global nutrient utilization efficiency (NUE) and global \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) cycle efficiency (CEE) (as defined in section 3.3) at steady state for standard wind stress.

2008]. It is tested whether an equatorward shift in the latitudinal position of the SHW can substantially reduce deep ocean ventilation and whether a shutdown of the southern circuit results in lower atmospheric CO₂. Furthermore, Toggweiler’s study is extended regarding two important issues. In their modeling study, Toggweiler et al. [2006] do not explicitly shift the SHW in order to test their hypothesis. Instead they weaken the SHW arguing that this would have essentially the same effect on upwelling in the SO as an equatorward wind displacement. Here, both the effect of changing the strength of the westerlies, as well as the response to an explicit shift in the position of the westerlies are investigated. Second, to avoid changes in nutrient utilization upon circulation changes, Toggweiler et al. [2006] simulate the production of sinking organic particles and \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) by restoring surface phosphate concentrations toward a fixed field. In addition to model runs with this same procedure, we also perform simulations with a prognostic formulation of marine biogeochemistry. This enables us to quantitatively analyze contributions from physical as well as biogeochemical processes (section 3.3).

[8] A series of different wind stress scenarios spanning the entire range of available reconstructions for glacial SH winds was created to generally test the model’s sensitivity to marine carbon cycling and atmospheric CO₂ (section 2.3). In a first set of experiments we probe the model response to a change in the SH westerlies’ amplitude and compare the results with the findings of previous studies [De Boer et al., 2008; Toggweiler et al., 2006; Toggweiler and Samuels, 1995]. In a second set we explore the effect of an explicit latitudinal shift in the SH westerlies’ position to find out whether the model behaves similarly as in the case of modified wind strength.

[9] In order to examine the robustness of the model response with respect to different initial states, we impose the various scenarios on 8 model setups (Table 1) that differ with respect to the type of boundary conditions, the strength of diapycnal mixing, the rate of Atlantic meridional overturning and the strength of the carbon “pumps” [Volk and Hoffert, 1985].

[10] We finally carry out additional model sensitivity tests examining the effect on atmospheric CO₂ induced by (1) increased CO₂ solubility, (2) reduced gas exchange in the SO due to enlarged sea ice cover, (3) \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) compensation, and (4) a 500 GtC carbon input into the atmosphere. In this last set of simulations we separately and jointly impose these four mechanisms on a model state in which atmospheric CO₂ is lowered in response to weakened SHW.

[11] The cost-efficient, dynamical, three-dimensional Bern3D ocean model [Müller et al., 2006] allows for an adequate representation of the large-scale ocean circulation and the cycling of major biogeochemical tracers (section 2.2). Its computational efficiency makes it ideally suited for multimillennial paleosimulations and large ensembles of sensitivity simulations.

2. Methods

2.1. Model Description

[12] The physical core of the Bern3D model is a frictional-geostrophic balance ocean model [Müller et al., 2006; Edwards and Marsh, 2005]. Model grid resolution is 36 by 36 cells in the horizontal and 32 vertical layers with exponentially increasing thickness toward the ocean bottom. The model includes an isopycnal diffusion scheme and Gent-McWilliams parametrization for eddy-induced transport [Griffies, 1998]. Convection is represented in the model by shifting down statically unstable water parcels from the surface further downward in the water column according to the density of the parcel. Subsequently, tracer concentrations are homogenized over remaining regions of static instability in the water column.

[13] Sea surface temperatures (SST) and salinities (SSS) are constrained by using either restoring (RBC) or mixed boundary conditions (MBC). Restoring compels SST and SSS to remain close to modern-day observational values. MBC on the other hand prescribes freshwater fluxes on the ocean surface rather than SSS such that circulation-salinity feedbacks are allowed to develop upon perturbation of the model state [Bryan, 1986]. An additional uniform freshwater surface flux from the Atlantic to the Pacific basin is applied in order to intensify and deepen the Atlantic MOC. Forcing fields for wind stress are based on a simple analytical profile that is zonally and temporally uniform (section 2.3). Here, meridional wind stress is neglected as in the work by Toggweiler et al. [2006]. Standard values for diapycnal diffusivity \( \kappa_{\text{dia}} \) and for the Atlantic-Pacific freshwater surface flux \( F_{\text{at-Pac}} \) have been selected to reproduce a realistic meridional overturning circulation as well as a realistic radiocarbon distribution on a basin-wide scale (Figure 1a). The application of analytical wind stress

Figure 1. Standard model state: (a–e) Basin-averaged annual mean depth profiles for natural \( \Delta^{14} \text{C} \), phosphate, dissolved inorganic carbon, alkalinity, and silicic acid. Solid lines correspond to modeled profiles. Dotted lines are data-based estimates from GLODAP (\( \Delta^{14} \text{C}, \text{DIC}, \text{alkalinity} \) [Key et al., 2004]) and World Ocean Atlas 2001 (phosphate, silicic acid [Conkright et al., 2002]). (f) Basin-averaged profiles for \( \Delta C_{\text{gas-ex}} \) (dotted lines), \( \Delta C_{\text{gas-ex}} + \Delta C_{\text{carb}} \) (dashed lines), and \( \Delta C_{\text{gas-ex}} + \Delta C_{\text{carb}} + \Delta C_{\text{soft}} \) (solid lines) following Gruber and Sarmiento [2002]. Black lines are based on model output, and red lines are calculated from data. Global mean surface values are set to zero for modeled and for data-based profiles.
Figure 1
profiles in this specific study as opposed to the NCEP wind stress data applied in other Bern3D studies [Müller et al., 2008; Siddall et al., 2007; Parekh et al., 2008; M. Gerber et al., Regional air-sea fluxes of anthropogenic carbon inferred with an Ensemble Kalman Filter, submitted to Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 2008] required an upward adjustment of $K_{isob}$ from 1.0 to $3.5 \times 10^{-5}$ m$^2$ s$^{-1}$. Standard parameter values for the physical and biogeochemical model are summarized in Table 2.

[14] The biogeochemical component of the Bern3D model represents the cycling of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), dissolved organic phosphate (DOP), $^{14}$C, alkalinity, phosphate, oxygen, iron and silicic acid. The ocean carbon cycle is coupled to a well-mixed atmospheric reservoir of CO$_2$. The formulations for air-sea gas exchange and carbonate chemistry in the ocean are based on the updated OCMIP-2 protocols [Orr et al., 1999; Najjar and Orr, 1999] and include adaptations as described by Müller et al. [2008]. Fully prognostic formulations are used to compute export production of organic matter, biogenic opal and CaCO$_3$ (see auxiliary material).$^1$

### 2.2. Model Evaluation

[15] The cost-efficient Bern3D model is able to capture the large-scale ocean circulation (Figure 2), the characteristics of the most important water masses, the large-scale distributions of a range of ventilation time scale tracers ($^{14}$C, CFCs, $^{39}$Ar, anthropogenic carbon [see Müller et al., 2006]), biogeochemical tracers, temperature and salinity (Figure 1 and Table 3), as well as the spatial patterns of POM, CaCO$_3$ and opal export production for standard parameter values. The results presented in the following two subsections have been obtained using the standard model parameter values (Table 2) and the standard analytical wind stress profile (section 2.3).

#### 2.2.1. Meridional Overturning Circulation and Water Masses

[16] The global annual mean residual overturning circulation (Figure 2a) in the deep ocean displays the clockwise overturning cell in the north driven by the formation of NADW and the anticyclonic cell in the south associated with the formation of AABW. The middepth NADW cell can be interpreted as the “northern biologically productive circuit” and the deep anticyclonic overturning can be associated with the “southern unproductive circuit” as described by Toggweiler et al. [2006]. Deep convection occurs predominantly in the North Atlantic area south of Greenland (NADW) as well as in the Ross and Weddell Seas next to Antarctica (AABW). Maximum overturning in the Atlantic (Figure 2b) reaches 21.7 Sv at around 55°N comparable to the estimate of Talley et al. [2003] of $17 \pm 5$ Sv. 14.8 Sv of this southward flow are exported from the Atlantic into the SO at 30°S. A weak anticyclonic overturning cell with a maximum of 2.4 Sv fills the deepest parts of the Atlantic with AABW. Overturning in the deep Pacific (Figure 2c) is anticyclonic and amounts to a maximum of 9.8 Sv, 4.8 Sv of which recirculate back into the SO. Deep equatorial upwelling in the Pacific amounts 5 Sv, relatively modest for a coarse-resolution model.

[17] A comparison between modeled and data-based salinity and natural radiocarbon zonal mean sections in the Atlantic and the Pacific reveals that overall surface-to-deep transport and the primary flow paths of the most important water masses are represented quite realistically in the model (not shown). The observed NADW tongue of relatively salty and young waters in the North Atlantic is clearly established in the model. Compared to data-based distributions, modeled NADW seems to be too young in $\Delta^{14}$C by about 20 per mil. The northward flowing Antarctic Intermediate Water (AAIW) in the Atlantic is modeled as a

---

$^1$Auxiliary materials are available in the HTML. doi:10.1029/2008PA001592.
relatively fresh water mass lying above NADW. The deep Atlantic is filled with AABW. Horizontal radiocarbon gradients in the deep Pacific are relatively well captured in the model, however, the water in the deep North Pacific is somewhat too old. AAIW penetrates the Pacific basin from surface to a depth of about 1 km.

2.2.2. Tracer Distributions and Biological Export Fluxes

The Bern3D model is able to adequately represent basin-scale surface-to-deep gradients for a range of different tracers (Figure 1). The modeled tracer distributions correlate reasonably well with observed fields interpolated to the model grid (Table 3). Simulated zonal mean sections in the Atlantic and the Pacific generally compare favorably with observations (e.g., Figures 3a and 3b). Modeled export fluxes for POM (15.9 GtC a\(^{-1}\)), CaCO\(_3\) (1.4 GtC a\(^{-1}\)) and opal (97.6 TmolSi a\(^{-1}\)) are compatible with observation-based estimates [Falkowski et al., 1998; Iglesias-Rodriguez et al., 2002; Treguer et al., 1995]. Their spatial patterns (Figures 3c and 3d) display the prominent large-scale features of the observed fields. However, because of imperfections in the model circulation, POM and CaCO\(_3\) export in the North Pacific are underestimated [Schlitzer, 2000].

![Figure 2. Annual mean residual overturning circulation (Sv) in the global, Atlantic, and Pacific ocean for the standard model configuration.](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tracer</th>
<th>Correlation With Data</th>
<th>Relative Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Data Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Temperature</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>Levitus and Boyer [1994]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salinity</td>
<td>79.2%</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>Levitus et al. [1994]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(\Delta^{14}C)</td>
<td>94.9%</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>Key et al. [2004]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phosphate</td>
<td>88.9%</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>Conbright and Boyer [2002]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preindustrial DIC</td>
<td>91.8%</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>Key et al. [2004]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alkalinity</td>
<td>92.3%</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>Key et al. [2004]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silicic acid</td>
<td>90.4%</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>Conbright and Boyer [2002]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1c shows that basin-wide surface-to-deep gradients in DIC are reasonably well simulated in the Bern3D model. The question remains, however, whether the three main processes responsible for shaping the spatial distribution of DIC in the ocean, namely the organic matter cycle, the CaCO$_3$ cycle and the air-sea gas exchange, do contribute in realistic proportions to the modeled gradients. Gruber and Sarmiento [2002] introduced the three tracers $D_{\text{C soft}}$, $D_{\text{C carb}}$ and $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ in order to assess their relative importance. $D_{\text{C soft}}$ and $D_{\text{C carb}}$ quantify the impact of the organic matter and CaCO$_3$ cycles in absence of gas exchange. $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ represents the residual part of the gradients in the salinity-normalized DIC distribution. Figure 1f displays simulated and data-based depth profiles of $D_{\text{C soft}}$, $D_{\text{C carb}}$ and $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$. Both positive and negative deviations for the observation-based profiles are simulated for the individual tracers. The comparison indicates that the relative strengths of the three processes are reasonably simulated.

$D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ is the sum of two opposing contributions $D_{\text{C bio}}$ and $D_{\text{C therm}}$ arising from biological processes and thermal fluxes, respectively. The net surface-to-deep gradients in $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ are therefore comparatively small (see Figure 1f). Note that the surface-to-deep gradient in the $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ corresponds to the solubility pump as defined by Volk and Hoffert [1985]. There is an ongoing debate in the literature about how realistically the solubility pump is represented in current ocean models [e.g., Broecker et al., 1999; Archer et al., 2000b; Toggweiler et al., 2003] It seems that in OGCMs the solubility pump is subject to a rather strong kinetic limitation by air-sea gas exchange. On the other hand, in box models the kinetic limitation seems to be much weaker [Toggweiler et al., 2003]. Unfortunately, it is currently not possible to estimate $D_{\text{C therm}}$ and thus the real strength of the solubility pump directly from data [Sarmiento and Gruber, 2006]. However, there are accurate data-based estimates available for the potential strength of the solubility pump, i.e., for the case with infinitely rapid gas exchange.

$D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ is the sum of two opposing contributions $D_{\text{C bio}}$ and $D_{\text{C therm}}$ arising from biological processes and thermal fluxes, respectively. The net surface-to-deep gradients in $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ are therefore comparatively small (see Figure 1f). Note that the surface-to-deep gradient in the $D_{\text{C gas ex}}$ corresponds to the solubility pump as defined by Volk and Hoffert [1985]. There is an ongoing debate in the literature about how realistically the solubility pump is represented in current ocean models [e.g., Broecker et al., 1999; Archer et al., 2000b; Toggweiler et al., 2003] It seems that in OGCMs the solubility pump is subject to a rather strong kinetic limitation by air-sea gas exchange. On the other hand, in box models the kinetic limitation seems to be much weaker [Toggweiler et al., 2003]. Unfortunately, it is currently not possible to estimate $D_{\text{C therm}}$ and thus the real strength of the solubility pump directly from data [Sarmiento and Gruber, 2006]. However, there are accurate data-based estimates available for the potential strength of the solubility pump, i.e., for the case with infinitely rapid gas exchange.

Next, we assess how the Bern3D model represents the solubility and the potential solubility pump to place the model in the current discussion. This is done by running the model in a setup without marine biota using standard gas exchange transfer velocities in a first experiment; in a second experiment transfer velocities are increased by a factor of fifteen. The two simulations yield surface-to-deep gradients of 91 $\mu$mol kg$^{-1}$ and 154 $\mu$mol kg$^{-1}$, respectively. The latter value is in very good agreement with the data-based estimate of 155 $\mu$mol kg$^{-1}$ by Sarmiento and Gruber [2006] for the potential solubility pump. In the Bern3D model, we simulate a deviation of 63 $\mu$mol kg$^{-1}$ between the realized and the potential solubility pump. Toggweiler et al. [2003] suggest in their concluding section that this deviation should be about 50 $\mu$mol kg$^{-1}$ in the real ocean.
These gradients and differences in gradients may also be compared with the overall preindustrial surface-to-deep DIC gradient of about 305 μmol kg\(^{-1}\). Uncertainties in the model representation of the solubility pump remain, as long as its real strength cannot be well quantified by observations.

### 2.3. Wind Stress Scenarios

[22] The reconstruction of past wind circulation from indirect proxy indicators is a complex task. The interpretation of Late Quaternary paleoenvironmental records from South America and Australia has therefore led to conflicting claims about the latitudinal position of the SHW at the LGM. One school argues for equatorward shifted westerlies [Moreno et al., 1999; Heusser, 1989] and another supports poleward shifted westerlies [Markgraf, 1989; Harrison and Dodson, 1993]. In a review of multiple proxy indicators [Shulmeister et al., 2004] come to the conclusion that there is good evidence for enhanced westerly flow and increased wind-driven upwelling at the LGM and that glaciation-interglaciation shifts were not more than 3° to 4°.

[23] Model results are also contradictory regarding the nature of SHW at the LGM. Some of them indicate a general intensification and a poleward displacement of their zonal maximum [Wyrwoll et al., 2000], and some suggest a weakening and a slight equatorward shift [Kim et al., 2002]. Others point at no significant latitudinal shift with either a modest weakening [Rojas et al., 2008] or a slight strengthening of the wind stress over the SO [Otto-Bliesner et al., 2006]. In light of the large gaps in the quantitative and qualitative understanding of the SH wind circulation at the LGM, we created a variety of scenarios that span the entire range of available reconstructions.

[24] All the wind stress scenarios are based on an analytical profile. For simplicity, the meridional wind stress component is neglected and the zonal component \(\tau^L(\phi)\) is zonally and temporally uniform. The profile’s mathematical expression is a function of two parameters \(\epsilon\) and \(\mu\) that allow for the scaling of the SH westerlies’ amplitude and for a latitudinal shift in the SH wind stress profile, respectively:

\[
\tau^L(\phi) = \begin{cases} 
0.2 + 0.8 \sin[6(\phi + 4 - \mu)] & \forall \phi \in [-80, -64 - \delta + \mu] \\
\cup (-34 + \delta + \mu, -19 + \mu], \\
& \epsilon(0.2 + 0.8 \sin[6(\phi + 4 - \mu)]) & \forall \phi \in (-64 - \delta + \mu, -34 + \delta + \mu], \\
0.25 \cos \left[ \frac{360}{\pi\mu} (\phi - \frac{\mu}{2}) \right] - 0.35 & \forall \phi \in (-19 + \mu, 19], \\
0.2 + 0.8 \sin[6(4 - \phi)] & \forall \phi \in (19, 80], \\
& \text{with } \delta = \frac{1}{6} \arcsin \left( \frac{1}{4} \right). 
\end{cases}
\]  

(1)

[25] Figure 4a shows that the standard profile (\(\epsilon = 1.0, \mu = 0\)) reasonably reproduces the zonally and seasonally averaged zonal component of the NCEP reanalysis derived data [Kalnay et al., 1996].

[26] We created two ensembles of scenarios by modifying either \(\epsilon\) or \(\mu\) with respect to their standard values. In the first ensemble (scaling scenarios) the SHW are weakened and intensified without altering their location by setting \(\epsilon\) to 0.25, 0.5, 0.75, 1.5, 2.0 and 3.0 (Figure 4a). In the second ensemble (shift scenarios) we shift the position of the SH westerlies’ peak poleward as well as equatorward (Figure 4c). Maximal latitudinal displacements are 5° toward the South Pole (\(\mu = -5\)) and 10° toward the equator (\(\mu = 10\)). The intermediate displacement scenarios are spaced by 1°.

[27] The Ekman pumping strength quantifies wind-driven upwelling, which corresponds to the degree of divergence of wind-driven horizontal flows in the sea surface. Wind-driven upwelling in the open ocean is generally limited to a surface layer some hundreds of meters thick. In the SO, however, the absence of the geostrophic balance above topographic ridges leads to a situation where deep water is brought to the surface through the action of winds. The Ekman pumping strength, integrated from 90°S, is depicted in Figures 4b and 4d for the different wind stress scenarios.

### 2.4. Model Setups and Spin-Up

[28] Although the performance of the Bern3D model regarding the representation of the modern ocean is quite reasonable (section 2.2), there still remains some degree of uncertainty due to the limited spatial coverage of the observations needed to test the model and due to the interpretation of indirect measurements. For this reason, the wind stress scenarios are imposed on 8 different setups to assess the robustness of the model response. As summarized in Table 1 the model setups differ in the type of boundary conditions (restoring versus mixed), the value for diapycnal diffusivity \(\kappa_{dia}\) and the intensity of the anomalous surface freshwater flux \(F_{Atl-Pac}\) from the Atlantic to the Pacific basin.

[29] The driving forces of the meridional overturning circulation (MOC) are still a matter of intense investigation. Presently, two major mechanisms are discussed [Kuhlbrodt et al., 2007]. The first one is turbulent mixing of heat from the surface into the ocean’s interior, the second is wind-driven upwelling in the Southern Ocean. From this perspective, the choice of diapycnal diffusivity \(\kappa_{dia}\) controls the relative importance of thermohaline versus wind-driven MOC forcing in a given model setup.

[30] The sinking of dense, salty water in the North Atlantic is an important organizing feature of the modern deep ocean circulation. Modeled deep water mass properties, ventilation time scales and tracer distributions in different ocean basins are quite sensitive to the modeled rate of deep water formation in the North Atlantic. The anomalous surface freshwater flux \(F_{Atl-Pac}\) permits a systematic increase (decrease) in Atlantic sea surface salinities and a strengthening (weakening) of the Atlantic MOC.

[31] For every model setup a steady state has been computed in the following manner: First, the physical model is spun-up for 10,000 model years using RBC.
Subsequently, air-sea freshwater fluxes are diagnosed and averaged over the last 1000 years to provide mixed boundary conditions. The model is now switched to mixed boundary conditions and anomalous freshwater fluxes $F_{\text{Atl-Pac}}$ are included. In the case of the setups that employ restoring, by definition RBC are maintained and no additional freshwater flux $F_{\text{Atl-Pac}}$ is applied. Then, a biogeochemical spin-up phase with a fixed atmospheric CO$_2$ mixing ratio of

_Figure 4._ The wind stress scenarios and the associated Ekman pumping: (a and b) scaling scenarios and (c and d) shift scenarios. The vertical solid lines at 51°S indicate the location of the tip of South America in the model geometry which corresponds to the northern border of the Southern Ocean.
278 ppm is run for another 10,000 years. Thereafter, atmospheric CO$_2$ is allowed to evolve freely. Annual means are used for the analysis.

2.5. Overview of Experiments

[32] In the first set of experiments we impose the scaling scenarios on a spun-up model state by instantaneously switching from the standard to a modified wind stress profile. The model is then run into a new steady state over 5000 model years. The gas transfer velocity field is kept unchanged upon wind stress perturbation. The second set consists of corresponding experiments employing the shift scenarios. Each of the wind stress scenarios is applied to the 8 different setups of the model. The CO$_2$ response in simulations where the SHW are both scaled and shifted simultaneously is essentially the superposition of the responses that are induced by the wind scaling and the shift separately. Such experiments with changes in both position and strength will not be further discussed. In a third set of experiments we investigate the additional effects of enhanced glacial CO$_2$ solubility, increased sea ice cover to gas exchange, CaCO$_3$ compensation and terrestrial carbon release with respect to atmospheric CO$_2$. A 500 GtC carbon input from the terrestrial biosphere [e.g., Shackleton, 1977] is represented by instantaneously increasing atmospheric CO$_2$ by 236 ppm. Enhanced CO$_2$ solubility is modeled by imposing a reconstruction of LGM SST and SSS [Paul and Schäfer-Neth, 2003] on the carbonate chemistry routine that calculates the speciation of DIC and pCO$_2$ in the sea surface. Reduced gas exchange from increased sea ice cover is represented by linearly scaling down piston velocities according to a monthly map of fractional sea ice cover for the LGM [Paul and Schäfer-Neth, 2003]. To simulate CaCO$_3$ compensation the CO$_3^{2-}$ concentration in each bottom ocean cell below 2000 m is restored toward the CO$_3^{2-}$ value diagnosed in the unperturbed state. This approach allows for both sediment dissolution and accumulation leading to an addition or removal of alkalinity and DIC in a 2:1 ratio. Starting from the initial state lowf2, we perform another five simulations where, in addition to a halving of the SH westerlies’ amplitude, the four additional mechanisms are taken into account separately and jointly. Each configuration is run into a new steady state during a period of 10,000 model years. A more detailed description of how the additional mechanisms are represented in this study can be found in the auxiliary material.

3. Model Results

3.1. Scaling Experiments

3.1.1. Ocean Circulation and Ventilation

[33] To compare our model results with those of previous studies, we first examine the dependence of the southward water flow leaving the Atlantic at 30$^\circ$S on the amplitude of the SHW (Figure 5). An almost perfectly linear relationship is simulated for the setups with RBC (solid/dashed black lines). When MBC are applied instead of RBC (all other lines), circulation-salinity feedbacks are allowed to develop which tend to counteract the effect of the changes in wind forcing. The response of the Atlantic outflow to changes in the amplitude of SHW is thus largely damped in these setups (red, blue and green solid/dashed lines). However, NADW formation and Atlantic outflow shut down when weak winds are applied in the setups with low AMOC (red solid/dashed lines).

[34] These findings confirm previous studies [Bugnion et al., 2006; Rahmstorf and England, 1997; Toggweiler and Samuels, 1995]. The tight coupling between SHW and the AMOC is an artifact of unrealistic restoring boundary conditions. We conclude furthermore that the strength of the coupling (i.e., the slope of the lines in Figure 5) significantly depends on the value of the diapycnal mixing parameter $\kappa_{\text{dia}}$. The setups with low $\kappa_{\text{dia}}$ respond more sensitively to changes in wind forcing as compared to the setups with standard diapycnal diffusion.

[35] Figure 6 shows the strength of AMOC and deep SO overturning (below a depth of 1000 m) as a function of the scaling parameter $\varepsilon$. These quantities can be interpreted as the intensity of the northern and the southern circuit, respectively [Toggweiler et al., 2006]. We analyze overturning in the deep SO as the interest here is on the link between the surface SO and the deep waters of the world ocean and not on shallow overturning.

[36] Across all the setups a significant trend is that the strength of AMOC (northern circuit) is positively correlated with the amplitude of the SHW. Modeled basin mean $\Delta^{14}$C signatures in the Atlantic (not shown) reflect that the simulated changes in Atlantic ventilation are modulated by the changes in AMOC. This is no surprise since the Atlantic basin is mainly ventilated by NADW.

[37] In the SO the interplay between wind stress, overturning and ventilation seems less evident. There is a tendency, but no univocal trend, that the SHW strength controls the intensity of deep SO overturning (Figure 6b). The frequency and depth of convective events in the SO are clearly linked to the amplitude of SHW with stronger winds leading to more vigorous convection and vice versa (not shown). At the same time there is an evident correlation between basin mean $\Delta^{14}$C signatures in the SO and the SHW strength (Figure 6c). The amplitude of ventilation changes in the SO also depends on the diapycnal mixing parameter $\kappa_{\text{dia}}$ (Figure 6c).

[38] The clockwise overturning cell in the upper North Pacific is very sensitive to an intensification of the SHW. In all the model setups this cell considerably increases in strength and extent for strong winds which is manifest in the $\Delta^{14}$C signature of the upper part of the Pacific basin (Figure 6d). Circulation-salinity feedbacks increase SSS in the North Pacific under MBC and amplify this sort of a response. In the case of weakened winds in contrast, the overturning cell becomes slower and shallower. A similar model response in the Pacific has also been found by De Boer et al. [2008], where an OGCM coupled to an energy moisture balance and a dynamic ice model is used to examine the circulation’s sensitivity to changes in the amplitude of SH winds.

[39] The simulated $\Delta^{14}$C signatures in the deep Pacific (Figure 6e) also indicate the tendency that the rate of ventilation increases for stronger SHW and decreases for weaker SHW. In some of the model setups, a stagnant water mass at the bottom of the Pacific basin appears when the
winds are weakened. In these cases, sharp drops in the deep Pacific $\Delta^{14}C$ signature are simulated (blue and green solid/dashed lines).

[40] In conclusion, these experiments cover a wide range with respect to SO circulation, convective activity and deep water ventilation and thus allow us to explore the carbon cycle response to a wide variety of physical changes.

### 3.1.2. Biogeochemistry and Atmospheric $pCO_2$

[41] Our results indicate that atmospheric $CO_2$ is rather sensitive to the amplitude of the SHW (Figure 7a). Intensified winds consistently induce a $CO_2$ rise in all the setups. The simulated changes are in the range of 35–60 ppm for a threefold strengthening ($\varepsilon = 3.0$). The biogeochemical rearrangements in response to a wind intensification are quite similar for all the setups. The modeled $CO_2$ rise in the atmosphere can be primarily attributed to an increase in sea surface $pCO_2$ in the SO.

[42] In the case of weakened winds however, the various setups respond differently. Setups with rather weak AMOC (black and red lines in Figure 7a) show a substantial drawdown in $CO_2$ of 30 to 55 ppm for a fourfold reduction in the strength of the SHW ($\varepsilon = 0.25$). The setups standard and strongFw, on the other hand, have very small responses of $\pm 2$ to $\pm 7$ ppm (blue and green solid lines). Finally, lowdiff and strongFw lowdiff display a nonmonotonic $CO_2$ response with respect to the wind-scaling factor $\varepsilon$ (blue and green dashed lines). The modeled reorganizations of the DIC and alkalinity distributions as well as of sea surface $pCO_2$ reveal that qualitatively different biogeochemical responses occur when weak winds are imposed on the various model setups. The attribution of changes in $CO_2$ to individual mechanisms will be further explored in section 3.3.

---

**Figure 5.** The “Drake Passage effect” [Toggweiler and Samuels, 1995]: The Atlantic outflow at the latitude of the Cape of Good Hope as a function of the northward Ekman transport at the tip of South America. With restoring boundary conditions (black lines) we model an almost perfectly linear relationship. When using mixed boundary conditions (green, blue, and red lines) we find a substantially weaker coupling between the Ekman transport and Atlantic outflow.
Figure 6. Circulation response to changes in SHW amplitude: (a) Maximum Atlantic overturning (Sv), (b) deep Southern Ocean overturning (Sv), (c) basin mean $\Delta^{14}$C signatures (per mil) for the Southern Ocean (below 640 m), (d) the upper Pacific (640–2100 m), and (e) the deep Pacific (2100–5000 m) as a function of the scaling factor $\varepsilon$. 
Figure 7. Biogeochemical response to changes in SHW amplitude: (a) Atmospheric CO₂ (ppm) and its variations split into (b) a physical and (c) a biological contribution as a function of the scaling factor $\varepsilon$. (d) Nutrient utilization efficiency in the Southern Ocean (%) (south of 34°S) and (e) the global CaCO₃ cycle efficiency (%).
3.2. Shift Experiments

3.2.1. Ocean Circulation and Ventilation

[43] Figure 8a shows that within the range of our shift scenarios for most setups we do not find any significant dependence of AMOC on the latitudinal position of the SHW. An exception to this are the two setups with MBC and weak AMOC (red dashed/solid lines). In both setups NADW formation collapses upon wind shifts in both directions.

[44] Equatorward shifts tend to reduce overturning in the SO whereas poleward shifts lead to an increase in SO overturning (Figure 8b). In the setups with MBC the typical structure of the deep SO overturning cell with a distinct maximum at around 40°S disappears when large equatorward shifts are applied. These results confirm the hypothesis that equatorward shifts tend to reduce the intensity of the southern overturning regime, as Toggweiler et al. [2006] suggested.

[45] However, the collapse of the SO overturning cell results in a decrease in SO ventilation only in the setups with low diapycnal diffusivity (Figure 8c). The corresponding setups show a decrease in δ18O of 50 to 77 permil upon large equatorward shifts (red, blue and green dashed lines). In the other setups there is almost no change in SO ventilation when the SHW are shifted in position. Convective activity in the SO is rather unresponsive to shifts in wind stress for all the setups.

[46] As in the case of wind scaling, the Pacific circulation responds quite sensitively to latitudinal shifts in the SHW in all the setups. Equatorward displacements reduce the rate of upwelling from the deep to the surface and enhance the extent of the clockwise overturning cell in the upper North Pacific. The most prominent change caused by a poleward displacement is an increase in deep equatorial upwelling in the Pacific. However, the changes in deep Pacific overturning and deep Pacific ventilation are rather small (not shown).

3.2.2. Biogeochemistry and Atmospheric pCO2

[47] The sensitivity of atmospheric CO2 to latitudinal displacements of the zonal wind maximum is significantly smaller compared to its dependence on the amplitude of the SHW. The simulations indicate that poleward displacements of the winds induce a slight CO2 drawdown whereas equatorward shifts tend to elevate atmospheric CO2 (Figure 8d). The concentration does not drop below 260 ppm when poleward shifts are imposed. Upon equatorward displacements of up to 10° we simulate a maximum CO2 concentration of 315 ppm. CO2 in the RBC and RBC lowdiff cases responds the least to wind shifts (black lines in Figure 8d). The setups with rather strong AMOC (blue and green lines) also display a rather low sensitivity. Most responsive are weakFw and weakFw lowdiff (red lines), the only setups showing major circulation rearrangements upon wind shifts.

3.3. Decomposition of CO2 Changes Into Physical and Biological Components

[48] To further understand the mechanisms controlling the CO2 response, the simulated CO2 changes are split into a “physical” and “biological” contribution as described below.

[49] Sinking organic particles transport carbon and nitrate to depth and thus deplete the sea surface in DIC while enriching it alkalinity. The organic matter cycle hence lowers sea surface pCO2 and increases the ocean’s carbon storage capacity compared to a world without marine biota. Nutrient utilization efficiency (NUE) is a frequently utilized measure to characterize the impact of the organic matter cycle on marine carbon cycling [Sigman and Boyle, 2000]:

\[
NUE = \left( 1 - \frac{PO_{4,\text{surface}}}{PO_{4,\text{deep}}} \right) \times 100
\]

\[PO_{4,\text{surface}}\] and \[PO_{4,\text{deep}}\] are the average PO4 concentrations in the surface and the deep ocean respectively.

[50] In contrast to the organic matter cycle, the production, sinking and redissolution of CaCO3 shells act to deplete sea surface alkalinity and to increase sea surface pCO2. To assess the effect of the CaCO3 cycle on CO2 partial pressures in the surface ocean we define similarly to NUE a CaCO3 cycle efficiency (CCE):

\[
CCE = \left( 1 - \frac{PAlk_{\text{surface}}}{PAlk_{\text{deep}}} \right) \times 100
\]

\[PAlk\] stands for potential alkalinity which is defined following Brewer et al. [1975]:

\[PAlk = [Alk] + R_{NP}[PO4]\]

[51] The second term on the right hand side of equation (4) represents a correction term to remove the influence of the organic matter cycle on the alkalinity distribution such that the distribution of PAlk is only affected by the cycling of biogenic CaCO3.

[52] Toggweiler et al. [2006] restore surface PO4 concentrations toward a fixed field to determine export production. However, reduced upwelling of remineralized carbon is accompanied by decreased nutrient supply to the surface and a likely change in NUE. Here, prognostic formulations of biological cycling are used (see auxiliary material) allowing surface nutrient fields and NUE to alter upon wind stress perturbations.

[53] The impact of changes in NUE and CCE on atmospheric CO2 is quantified by an additional factorial run. Euphotic zone concentrations of PO4 and potential alkalinity (PAlk) are instantaneously restored toward seasonally varying fields that were previously diagnosed in the initial steady state. In doing so, NUE and CCE remain largely unchanged. Note that equation (4) implies that this procedure also keeps sea surface alkalinitities essentially unmodified when the model state is perturbed.

[54] Here, we arbitrarily term the modeled changes in atmospheric CO2 resulting from the simulations with PO4 and PAlk-restoring “physical” (\[\Delta pCO2_{\text{phys}}\]). These are induced by changes in the interplay of circulation, CO2 solubility and carbon chemistry, air-sea gas exchange, and
Figure 8. Model response to shifts in the latitudinal position of the SHW: (a) Maximum Atlantic meridional overturning (Sv), (b) deep Southern Ocean overturning (Sv), (c) basin mean $\Delta^{14}C$ signature (per mil) in the Southern Ocean (below 640 m), (d) atmospheric CO$_2$ (ppm), and (e) the global CaCO$_3$ cycle efficiency (%) as a function of the shift parameter $\mu$. Positive values of $\mu$ correspond to equatorward wind shifts, and negative values of $\mu$ relate to poleward wind shifts.
the cycling of organic material, calcite and silicic acid for maintained NUE and CEE.

[55] The difference in $\Delta pCO_2$ between a nutrient restoring simulation ($\Delta pCO_2,phys$) and the corresponding run with fully prognostic biology is associated with $\Delta pCO_2,biot$ such that:

$$\Delta pCO_2,biot = \Delta pCO_2,phys + \Delta pCO_2,biot$$

$\Delta pCO_2,biot$ thus reflects CO$_2$ changes associated with altered NUE and CEE.

3.3.1. Scaling Experiments

[56] When the SHW are intensified physical and biological mechanisms play equally important roles in controlling CO$_2$ changes (Figures 7b and 7c). In the case of a threefold intensification ($\epsilon = 3.0$) the physical component $\Delta pCO_2,phys$ explains 15 to 40 ppm of the CO$_2$ rise, largely because of altered circulation in the upper Pacific. A large fraction of this ocean region is ventilated by the clockwise overturning cell in the upper North Pacific when subjected to strong SHW (section 3.1.1). Cold and carbon-rich water masses stemming from the deep ocean get replaced by warm and well-ventilated waters that originate from the Pacific surface.

[57] $\Delta pCO_2,biot$ contributes 6 to 40 ppm to the modeled CO$_2$ increase in the case of very strong winds ($\epsilon = 3.0$; Figure 7d). A decrease in NUE in the SO (south of 34$^\circ$S) is mainly responsible. The rate of exchange between deep and surface waters in the SO increases and thus the supply of nutrients to the surface is enhanced which results in increased export production. Yet only a fraction of the increase in nutrient supply is utilized by marine biology and thus sea surface PO$_4$ and DIC concentrations rise. This implies that the marine organic matter cycle becomes less efficient in reducing sea surface pCO$_2$ when SHW are intensified. Changes in CaCO$_3$ cycle efficiency are small (Figure 7e) such that the overall biological response is dominated by the changes in the organic matter cycle which lead to an increase in atmospheric CO$_2$.

[58] As mentioned earlier (section 3.1.2), the various setups respond differently to weakened SHW. The simulations leading to a substantial CO$_2$ drawdown display a significant decrease of surface pCO$_2$ in the SO (RBC, RBC lowdiff, weakFw and weakFw lowdiff; black and red lines in Figure 7a). Such behavior is absent in the scenarios with a modest CO$_2$ response (standard, lowdiff, strongFw and strongFw lowdiff; blue and green lines in Figure 7a).

[59] Most setups display a very small physical CO$_2$ response when weak SHW are applied (Figure 7b). Only the RBC simulations (black lines) show a distinctly negative $\Delta pCO_2,phys$ of around $-18$ ppm for $\epsilon = 0.25$. This CO$_2$ drawdown is associated with enhanced carbon storage in the upper Pacific and in the deep North Atlantic which results from a slowing and shoaling of the respective overturning cells.

[60] NUE in the SO increases monotonically in all the setups when the SHW are reduced in strength (Figure 7d). However, only in the setups RBC, RBC lowdiff, weakFw and weakFw lowdiff this NUE increase leads to a substan-

[61] In our model more than 85% of particulate organic matter is remineralized in the top 1000 meters, whereas about half of the CaCO$_3$ shells dissolve below a depth of 2500 m. For this reason, the CaCO$_3$ cycle is more strongly affected by the deep stagnant water masses than the organic matter cycle. The enhanced dissolution of CaCO$_3$ leads to an increase in alkalinity at depth and, as a consequence, to a depletion of alkalinity at the surface and in the thermocline, and thus to higher values of CEE when SHW are weakened (blue and green lines in Figure 7e). Low $\kappa_{dia}$ leads to a more efficient alkalinity accumulation in the deep since upward diffusive transport is limited.

[62] In summary, an increase in SHW strength consistently leads to an increase in atmospheric CO$_2$ for all model setups in the range of 20 to 40 ppm per 100% change in wind stress strength. Decreased nutrient utilization efficiency and enhanced ventilation increase atmospheric CO$_2$ over the range of model setups. In contrast, the CO$_2$ response to weakened winds is sensitive to the model setup. Simulated changes are in the range of $-2$ to $-55$ ppm for a fourfold reduction in wind stress.

3.3.2. Shift Experiments

[63] The response in the carbon cycle to shifts in the position of the SHW is diverse for the different setups. The model setups with RBC show almost no sensitivity in atmospheric CO$_2$ when the SHW are shifted. In the setups with MBC, however, quite a robust trend emerges in the sense that poleward shifts induce a slight reduction in atmospheric CO$_2$ whereas equatorward shifts lead to a modest CO$_2$ increase (Figure 8d). Both physical and biological mechanisms contribute toward the simulated changes in atmospheric CO$_2$. $\Delta pCO_2,phys$ and $\Delta pCO_2,biot$ are generally of similar magnitude and of the same sign (not shown).

[64] The results show that the position of the Deacon cell [Döös and Webb, 1994] is tightly attached to the westerlies’ zonal maximum. Equatorward wind shifts lead to northward shifts of this cell and of the associated fronts and hence increase the outcrop area. Accordingly, poleward displacements reduce the area where upwelled deep waters are exposed to the atmosphere. These circulation rearrangements in the SO are also manifest in modeled surface PO$_4$. The area of elevated PO$_4$ concentration in the SO decreases in the case of poleward wind shifts and increases for equatorward wind shifts.

[65] Preindustrial air-sea fluxes of CO$_2$ are characterized by outgassing in the SO (south of 44$^\circ$S), uptake at midlatitudes of both hemispheres (18–44$^\circ$N and 18–49$^\circ$N) and strong outgassing in the tropics (18$^\circ$N–18$^\circ$S). This pattern is relatively well captured by means of inverse estimates in
a number of ocean models including the Bern3D model [Mikaloff Fletcher et al., 2007]. In the wind shift experiments the most prominent changes in sea surface pCO₂ occur in a latitudinal belt at around 40°S, the location of the northern edge of the modern Deacon cell. Shifts toward the equator elevate pCO₂ and displacements toward the pole lead to a pCO₂ reduction in that region. The model results thus suggest that the zone of CO₂ outgassing in the SO contracts upon poleward wind shifts and expands upon equatorward shifts, explaining the simulated changes in ΔpCO₂phys.

[66] The biological contribution ΔpCO₂bio is dominated by NUE changes in the setups with standard diapycnal diffusivity κdia and by CEE changes in the setups with low κdia. In the former an increase in the Deacon overturning under equatorward shifts increases both nutrient supply and export production in the SO by about 20%. The result is a slight reduction in NUE in the SO (not shown). In the latter reduced SO ventilation and decreased deep upwelling in the Pacific enhance CEE when the SHW are shifted toward the equator (Figure 8e).

### 3.4. Additional Model Sensitivities

[67] To examine further model sensitivities, in addition to halving the SH westerlies’ amplitude, we separately apply to the setup lowdiff the effects of (1) increased glacial CO₂ solubility resulting from changes in SST and SSS, (2) hampered air-sea gas exchange in the SO due to enhanced sea ice cover, (3) CaCO₃ compensation, and (4) a 500 GtC carbon input into the atmosphere stemming from the terrestrial biosphere [e.g., Shackleton, 1977] (Table 4, Exp2, Exp3, Exp4 and Exp5; for details of these simulations see auxiliary material). Finally, we take into account all of these mechanisms simultaneously (Table 4: Exp6). Table 4 summarizes the simulations and the results. The changes in the DIC distribution due to a halving of the SHW (Exp1-control) are illustrated in Figures 9a and 9b, the DIC changes in response to the additional processes (Exp6-Exp1) are depicted in Figures 9c and 9d.

[68] When the four additional effects are taken into account simultaneously (Exp6) we achieve a total CO₂ drawdown of 22 ppm to 256 ppm. Increased biological efficiencies (ΔpCO₂bio = −24 ppm), enhanced CO₂ solubility (−24 ppm) and CaCO₃ compensation (−15 ppm) are mainly responsible for the CO₂ reduction. On the other hand, the terrestrial carbon input (+38 ppm, without CaCO₃ compensation), physical rearrangements (ΔpCO₂phys = +2 ppm) and hampered gas exchange in the SO due to extended sea ice coverage (+5 ppm) elevate CO₂.

[69] The halving of the SH westerly winds’ amplitude induces an AMOC reduction of about 8 Sv and deteriorates the ventilation in the upper Pacific and the Southern Ocean (blue dashed lines in Figures 6a, 6c, and 6d for ε = 0.5). Reduced nutrient supply to the surface decreases POM export production by about 30%, but increases global NUE by 5% (Table 4). Export of biogenic CaCO₃ also decreases, but CEE remains virtually unchanged. The induced changes in marine carbon cycling lead to a drawdown of 22 ppm (Exp1). In this simulation, deep ocean alkalinity and DIC increase roughly in concert such that their difference, which approximates the CO₂ concentration, changes only marginally. For this reason, we simulate only a small additional response of −3 ppm when CaCO₃ compensation is considered in addition to the halving of the SHW (Exp4).

[70] The modeled drawdown of 24 ppm due to the solubility effect (Exp2) is very close in magnitude to the estimate of 23.5 ppm given by Sigman and Boyle [2000] which was calculated using the CYCLOPS ocean box model [Keir, 1988] and a rough guess of glacial SST and SSS. As found in other GCMs [Archer et al., 2003], increased sea ice cover in the SO leads to higher atmospheric CO₂ (Exp3). Enhanced sea ice cover excludes surface waters with low pCO₂ from gas exchange such that the new atmospheric CO₂ equilibrium is shifted toward a higher pCO₂. The input of 500 GtC carbon into the atmosphere induces a CO₂ increase of 38 ppm without CaCO₃ compensation and 23 ppm with it. The first value is in good agreement with an estimate of 37 ppm for the uncompensated case [Archer et al., 2000a], the latter is somewhat higher than the 17 ppm estimate reported in that same paper for the compensated case.

[71] In a further experiment (Exp7), all of the additional effects described above were considered, but the terrestrial carbon input was excluded. In this case CO₂ was 233 ppm. The total simulated 45 ppm drawdown is of similar magnitude as the 43 ppm reduction modeled by Brovkin et al. [2007] in a comparable model configuration. In their study glacial SST, SSS, ocean circulation and sea ice cover were obtained by prescribing a complete set of glacial forcings to the CLIMBER-2 intermediate complexity Earth system model.

[72] Changes in oceanic DIC concentrations resulting from the wind weakening and associated changes in biological efficiencies (Figures 9a and 9b) are relatively large.
and spatially heterogeneous. The concentrations increase in the upper Pacific and in the Atlantic at intermediate depths (2–3 km). In the intermediate and deep Pacific, as well as in the upper Atlantic, carbon storage is reduced. Changes in the DIC distribution induced by increased solubility, enhanced SO sea ice cover, CaCO$_3$ compensation and a 500 GtC carbon input into the atmosphere are generally higher in the ocean interior than near the surface (Figures 9c and 9d). Most of the additional carbon that is taken up by the ocean in response to these four mechanisms is transported by NADW.

4. Summary and Conclusions

The focus of this study is a hypothesis that calls for reduced upwelling of CO$_2$-rich deep waters in the SO resulting from an equatorward shift of the SHW to explain low glacial CO$_2$ levels in the atmosphere [Toggweiler et al., 2006]. We perform a systematic sensitivity analysis of the large-scale ocean circulation, marine carbon cycling and atmospheric CO$_2$ to changes in the strength and position of the SHW to probe this mechanism in the Bern3D coarse-resolution ocean model.

[74] Mechanisms of CO$_2$ variations are quantified by targeted sensitivity simulations and analyses. The wide range of model setups and wind stress scenarios applied resulted in a variety of simulated physical and biogeochemical responses. These include strongly reduced deep SO overturning and low ventilation of the deep ocean, corresponding to the weak southern circuit suggested by Toggweiler et al. [2006]. The results, in combination with available evidence on glacial winds, suggest that SH wind changes played a limited role in modulating glacial-interglacial atmospheric CO$_2$ concentrations. In addition, and in further conflict with Toggweiler et al. [2006], an equatorward shift in SHW results in a CO$_2$ increase and not in the hypothesized decrease.

[75] The Bern3D model is able to adequately represent ocean circulation and the cycling of major biogeochemical tracers (see section 2.2). Yet, as with any modeling study, a number of caveats apply to our results. Although the preindustrial distribution of DIC is reasonably simulated...
compared to data-based estimates (see Figure 1c and Table 3), there remains some uncertainty related to the role of gas exchange and the solubility pump (see section 2.2). Instead by an interactive atmosphere, SST and SSS are constrained by applying restoring or mixed boundary conditions. However, our results are in good agreement with a recent study by De Boer et al. [2008] who examine the response of the meridional overturning circulation to changes in the SHW strength using an OGCM coupled to an energy moisture balance model for the atmosphere. Furthermore, the authors emphasize the important role of winds in stirring salinity gradients in the ocean. In our study, salinity-circulation feedbacks are accounted for under changes in wind stress when mixed boundary conditions are applied.

[76] Eddy fluxes are believed to play a more central role in the dynamics of the SO than in other areas of the world ocean [Rintoul et al., 2001]. Eddies are not represented explicitly in the Bern3D model. Furthermore, ocean-ice interactions in the SO are thought to be crucial for the formation of deep waters around Antarctica and convection is only represented in a highly parameterized way.

[77] A reduction in the strength of SHW leads to a decline in simulated atmospheric CO2. Ventilation in the SO is reduced by a decrease in the frequency and depth of convective events. In addition, biological mechanisms contribute toward the modeled CO2 drawdown which is up to 34 ppm for a 50% reduction in SHW strength. A 50% increase on the other hand leads to a rise in atmospheric CO2 of up to 24 ppm.

[78] When the SHW are shifted in their latitudinal position the meridional overturning circulation, marine carbon cycling and atmospheric CO2 respond relatively insensitively. A poleward shift of 5° lowers CO2 by up to 16 ppm whereas an equatorward shift of 5° induces a CO2 increase of maximum 14 ppm. The wind shifts do not substantially alter ventilation in the SO. Rather they affect atmospheric CO2 by changing the outcrop area of deep waters. As in the wind-scaling simulations changes in marine biology tend to enforce the CO2 response that is induced by physical mechanisms.

[79] In additional sensitivity runs, a limited set of mechanisms for low CO2 is quantified. We model a drawdown of atmospheric CO2 to 256 ppm from a preindustrial value of 278 ppm when prescribing reduced wind stress in the SO, enhanced CO2 solubility, reduced gas transfer velocities by sea ice expansion and a 500 GtC carbon input into the atmosphere due to reduced terrestrial carbon storage in glacial times. An increase in biological efficiencies (−24 ppm) and the enhanced CO2 solubility (−24 ppm) are mainly responsible for the CO2 reduction. CaCO3 compensation in response to reduced wind stress alone is small (−3 ppm). However, the reaction of CaCO3 sediments reduces the atmospheric CO2 rise due to the 500 GtC carbon input from 38 ppm to 23 ppm. The simulated amplitudes of the additional effects are generally in good agreement with those reported in previous studies [e.g., Brovkin et al., 2007; Archer et al., 2006a; Sigman and Boyle, 2000]. Additional mechanisms than the limited set considered here are required to account for the full glacial-interglacial CO2 change [see, e.g., Broecker and Henderson, 1998; Sigman and Boyle, 2000; Archer et al., 2006a; Kohfeld et al., 2005].

[80] Physical as well as biological oceanic controls on CO2 should be taken into account simultaneously in scenarios of low glacial atmospheric CO2. Decreased ventilation in the SO reduces the supply of nutrient-rich deep waters to the surface potentially increasing the efficiency of the organic matter cycle in drawing down surface pCO2. In contrast, a reduction in deep ocean ventilation might also lead to a substantial increase of deep ocean alkalinity in response to a more efficient CaCO3 cycle. This would reduce surface alkalinity and hence increase surface pCO2. These effects of the organic matter and CaCO3 cycle are antipodal with respect to atmospheric CO2 and their respective amplitudes depend on the details of the glacial circulation. We have assessed these biological implications on atmospheric CO2 using the concepts of nutrient utilization efficiency (NUE) and CaCO3 cycle efficiency (CCE).

[81] The idea of changes in deep ocean ventilation as being an important reason for increased CO2 storage in the glacial ocean [Toggweiler, 1999] appears tempting given the available data [e.g., Duplessy et al., 1988; Adkins et al., 2002; Hodell et al., 2003; Marchitto et al., 2007]. However, our results indicate that mechanisms other than wind changes were probably more relevant for altering the ventilation of the ocean’s deep layers. For instance, Watson and Naveira Garabato [2006] propose that mixing in the SO was slower because denser deep waters were formed and a decreased buoyancy flux at the surface suppressed upwelling. Sigman et al. [2004] suggest that the cooling caused increased stratification by weakening the role of temperature in polar ocean density structure. If variations in the SHW are invoked as the main mechanism for the glacial CO2 drawdown a reduction in SHW strength of at least 50% would be required. Such a weakening in SO winds appears rather unlikely given the available reconstructions discussed in section 2.3 [e.g., Shulmeister et al., 2004; Otto-Blesner et al., 2006; Rojas et al., 2008]. These conclusions are supported by a recent study that is based on the LOVECLIM earth system model of intermediate complexity [Menviel et al., 2008].

Acknowledgments. This study was funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation and the EU projects CARBOOCEAN (511176-2) and EUROCEANS (511106-2). P.P. acknowledges support from the Marie Curie International Incoming Fellowship. We thank N. R. Edwards, S. A. Mühler, and T. F. Stocker for helpful comments. Critical reviews from V. Brovkin, J. R. Toggweiler, and one anonymous reviewer are acknowledged.

References


Falkowski, P. G., R. T. Barber, and V. Smetacek (1998), Biogeochemical controls and feedbacks on ocean primary productivity, Science, 282, 201 – 206.


Harrison, S., and J. Dodson (1993), Climates of Australia and New Guinea since 18000 years, in Global Climates Since the Last Glacial Maximum, edited by E. H. Wright Jr. et al., pp. 265 – 293, Univ. of Minn. Press, Minneapolis.


Toggweiler, J. (1999), Variation of atmospheric CO$_2$ by ventilation of the ocean’s deepest water, Paleoceanography, 14, 571–588.


F. Joos, P. Parekh, and T. Tschumi, Climate and Environmental Physics, Physics Institute, University of Bern, Sidlerstrasse 5, CH-3012 Bern, Switzerland. (tschumi@climate.unibe.ch)
How important are Southern Hemisphere wind changes for low glacial carbon dioxide? A model study
supplementary material

T. Tschumi, F. Joos and P. Parekh,
Climate and Environmental Physics,
Physics Institute, University of Bern,
Sidlerstrasse 5, CH-3012 Bern,
Switzerland.


1 Parametrization of organic matter, opal and CaCO$_3$ production

In the biogeochemical component of the Bern3D model euphotic zone depth is uniformly set to 75 meters. Biological consumption of phosphate $\Gamma_{\text{new}}$ is limited by temperature, the availability of light (I), phosphate (PO$_4$) and iron (Fe) and is parametrized following Doney et al. [2006]:

$$\Gamma_{\text{new}} = \frac{T + 2}{T + 10} F_I \min \left( F_{PO_4}, F_F \right) \min \left( PO_4, \frac{F_F}{R_{Fe:P}} \right) \frac{1}{\tau},$$

(1)

$$F_I = \frac{I}{I + \kappa_I}, \quad F_{PO_4} = \frac{PO_4}{PO_4 + \kappa_{PO_4}}, \quad F_F = \frac{F_F}{F_F + \kappa_{Fe}}.$$  

(2)

$T$ stands for temperature in degrees Celsius, $I$ for insolation, $\kappa_{Fe}$ and $\kappa_{PO_4}$ are the half-saturation constants for PO$_4$-uptake with respect to phosphate and iron respectively. $\tau$ represents the biomass turnover timescale set here to 30 days. $R_{Fe:P}$ is the ratio of Fe- to PO$_4$-uptake. A fraction $\sigma = \frac{2}{3}$ of biological productivity $\Gamma_{\text{new}}$ enters the DOP-pool, which decays into its mineral constituents with an e-folding lifetime $\tau_{DOP} = 0.5$ yrs (Yamanaka and Tajika [1997]). The remaining fraction $\Gamma_{\text{new}}(1 - \sigma)$ is exported out of the euphotic zone as sinking particulate organic matter (POM) and is instantaneously remineralized in the water column beneath. The downward flux of phosphate $F_{PO_4}(z)$ is scaled according to the empirical power law profile of Martin et al. [1987]:

$$F_{PO_4}(z) = \int_0^{z_{\text{euphotic}}} (1 - \sigma) \Gamma_{\text{new}}(z') dz' \left( \frac{z}{z_{\text{euphotic}}} \right)^{-\alpha} \quad \text{for } z > z_{\text{euphotic}}$$

(3)
The remaining POM-flux at the bottom of the ocean is remineralized in the deepest box. Biologically driven fluxes of carbon, alkalinity, oxygen and iron are linked to those of phosphorous using fixed elemental ratios in organic matter ($R_{C:P}$, $R_{Alk:P}$, $R_{O_2:P}$, $R_{Fe:P}$).

The oceanic iron-cycle is represented in the model following Parekh et al. [2007]. Dissolved iron is partitioned into free, Fe', and complexed, FeL, forms assuming that the total organic ligand concentration is uniform and thermodynamic equilibration is rapid. Iron enters the ocean through aeolian deposition and is removed therefrom by scavenging.

Modeled production of CaCO$_3$ and opal shells depends on biological productivity $\Gamma_{\text{new}}$ and on availability of silicic acid. In silicic acid replete conditions, opal production through growth of diatoms $\Gamma_{\text{opal}}$ is favored at the expense of CaCO$_3$ production $\Gamma_{\text{calcite}}$. The following formulations adopted from the HAMOCC5 model (Maier-Reimer et al. [2005]) are used to represent this competition:

$$\Gamma_{\text{opal}} = \min(\Gamma_{\text{new}}(1-\sigma)R_{Si:P}^D \frac{Si}{K_{Si}^D + Si}, 0.5Si),$$

$$\Gamma_{\text{calcite}} = R_{Ca:P}^{calc} \min(M_{CaCO_3} \Gamma_{\text{new}}(1-\sigma), \Gamma_{\text{new}}(1-\sigma) - \frac{\Gamma_{\text{opal}}}{R_{Si:P}^D}),$$

where $\Gamma_{\text{opal}}$ is in units $\text{molSi} \text{m}^{-3} \text{s}^{-1}$ and $\Gamma_{\text{calcite}}$ is in $\text{molC} \text{m}^{-3} \text{s}^{-1}$. $R_{Si:P}^D$ is the ratio of silicate to phosphorous in diatoms, $K_{Si}^D$ is the half-saturation constant for silicate uptake in diatoms, $M_{CaCO_3}$ is the maximum rain-ratio and $R_{Ca:P}^{calc}$ stands for the calcium to phosphorous ratio in calcifiers.

Observations indicate that half-saturation constants for silica-uptake in diatoms $K_{Si}^D$ vary significantly in the real ocean (Martin-Jézéquel et al. [2000], Sommer [1986]). Therefore $K_{Si}^D$ is prescribed in the model as a function of the local yearly maximum silicate concentration, $Si_{max}$, following Aumont and Bopp [2006]:

$$K_{Si}^D = K_{Si}^{min} + K_{Si}^{max} \frac{Si_{max}^2}{(K_{Si}^{D*})^2 + Si_{max}^2},$$

Depending on light-, silicate-, phosphorous- and iron-availability, diatoms assimilate variable amounts of silicate to build up their frustules (Sarthou et al. [2005]). Thus the ratio of silicate to phosphorous in diatoms $R_{Si:P}^D$ is computed following Aumont and Bopp [2006]:

$$R_{Si:P}^D = R_{Si:P}^{calc} \frac{[Si]}{K_{Si}^D + [Si]} (5.4 \exp(-4.23 \min(F_I, F_{PO_4}, F_{Fe})) + 1.13),$$

where the light-, phosphorous- and iron-limitation terms $F_I$, $F_{PO_4}$ and $F_{Fe}$ are calculated as in equation (1).

Opal and CaCO$_3$ are instantaneously exported from the euphotic zone and redissolved in the water-column beneath the site of production. Downward fluxes are assumed to decrease exponentially with length-scale $l_{opal} = 10$ km for opal and $l_{calcite} = 3.5$ km for CaCO$_3$:

$$F_{opal/calcite}(z) = \int_{z'=z_{euphotic}}^{0} (1-\sigma)\Gamma_{opal/calcite}(z')dz' \exp\left(-\frac{z - z_{euphotic}}{l_{opal/calcite}}\right) \text{ for } z > z_{euphotic}$$

The remaining fluxes of opal and CaCO$_3$ at the ocean bottom are redissolved in the deepest box.
2 Model Representation of Additional Mechanisms

2.1 CO\textsubscript{2} Solubility

To estimate the effect of increased CO\textsubscript{2} solubility we impose a reconstruction of LGM SST and SSS on the carbonate chemistry routine that calculates the speciation of DIC and pCO\textsubscript{2} in the sea surface. Note that the temperature and salinity fields relevant to ocean dynamics are kept unchanged. The fields for glacial SST and SSS are derived through interpolation from the data set provided by Paul and Schäfer-Neth [2003] which is a merge of CLIMAP and GLAMAP data with modeling results.

2.2 Sea Ice Cover

In glacial times, increased sea ice cover around Antarctica might have decreased outgassing of CO\textsubscript{2} in the Southern Ocean. Using a box model, Stephens and Keeling [2000] have demonstrated a substantial lowering of atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2} resulting from reduced air-sea gas exchange in the Antarctic region. However, Archer et al. [2003] showed that in contrast to box models, such an effect cannot be found in GCMs. In this study we examine the mechanism by reducing gas exchange in the domain around Antarctica where sea ice was present at the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM). Based on the data set provided by Paul and Schäfer-Neth [2003] a monthly map of fractional sea ice cover was obtained through area-weighted interpolation onto the coarse Bern3D model grid. Fractional sea ice cover was then used to linearly scale down gas transfer velocities according to:

\[ k_{\text{ice}}w = (1 - f_{\text{ice}})k_{\text{open}}w, \]

where \( k_{\text{open}} \) denotes the gas transfer velocity for an open ocean surface and \( f_{\text{ice}} \) is the fractional sea ice cover. Circulation and biological uptake were held unaffected by the addition of sea ice.

2.3 CaCO\textsubscript{3} Compensation

The mechanism of CaCO\textsubscript{3} compensation calls for a deep ocean drop in CO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−3} due to an addition of excess remineralized CO\textsubscript{2} from the upper ocean (Marchitto et al. [2004]). The resulting decline in the saturation of deep waters with respect to CaCO\textsubscript{3} initiates the dissolution of seafloor CaCO\textsubscript{3} sediments. This process adds alkalinity and DIC to the seawater in a 2:1 ratio and thus shifts the speciation of DIC away from dissolved CO\textsubscript{2}. When this signal propagates to the ocean surface, pCO\textsubscript{2} is reduced, causing a further uptake of atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2}.

CaCO\textsubscript{3} compensation acts as homeostat for the deep ocean carbonate concentration. We simulate the effect of this process by restoring CO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−3} at the sea floor deeper than 2000 meters towards CO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−3}\textsuperscript{*}, the carbonate concentrations diagnosed in the initial state:

\[ J_{\text{CO}_3^{2-}}^{\text{sed}}(i, j, k_{i,j}) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{\tau_{\text{rest}}}(CO_3^{2-}(i, j, k_{i,j}) - CO_3^{2-}(i, j, k_{i,j})), & \text{if } \text{depth}(k_{i,j}) > 2000 \text{m}, \\ 0, & \text{otherwise}. \end{cases} \]

\[ SMS_{\text{DIC}}^{\text{sed}}(i, j, k_{i,j}) = J_{\text{CO}_3^{2-}}^{\text{sed}}(i, j, k_{i,j}) \]

\[ SMS_{\text{ALK}}^{\text{sed}}(i, j, k_{i,j}) = 2J_{\text{CO}_3^{2-}}^{\text{sed}}(i, j, k_{i,j}) \]
SMS\textsubscript{sed}\textsuperscript{DIC} and SMS\textsubscript{sed}\textsuperscript{ALK} are the source-minus-sink terms for DIC and alkalinity that result from sediment dissolution or accumulation. The restoring timescale $\tau_{\text{rest}}$ is set to 10 years as we are not interested in the transient response, but want to bring the model into the new equilibrium as quickly as possible. The latitudinal and meridional indices of the model grid are denoted by $i$ and $j$, while $k_{i,j}$ represents the depth-index of the deepest ocean grid cell above the sea floor.

2.4 Terrestrial Carbon Release

Terrestrial carbon release (Crowley [1995], Bird et al. [1994], Shackleton [1977]) is simulated by injecting 500 GtC into the atmosphere. This is done by instantaneously increasing atmospheric CO$_2$ by 236 ppm.

References


