Fallible Authority

Adrian Suter
Departement for Old Catholic Theology
University of Berne

International Conference:
The Authority of the Churches in a Pluralist Europe
University of Exeter, 7-10 September 2015
Xerox 99 ???
Pastor aeternus from Vatican I

> Chapter 3: primacy of jurisdiction
> Chapter 4: Infallibility in his ex cathedra teaching office
> Logical connection:
  — you *must* obey the pope (because he is the supreme leader)
  — you *can* obey the pope (because his infallible in his ex cathedra statements on doctrine and moral)
Two types of authority (Bochenski)

> Epistemic authority
  — authority by expertise
  — form of speech: statement, truth claim
  — expected reaction: acceptance of truth of statement

> Deontic authority
  — authority by command
  — form of speech: instruction, command
  — expected reaction: obedience
Relation with three variables

> (Person or body) A
  — has authority over
> (person or group) B
  — on/in the field of
> (topic/context) C
Basis of authority

> Personal authority
  — based on the personality, confidence, authenticity etc.

> Formal authority
  — based on the status, title, office etc.

> Constitutional authority
  — special case: includes the means to enforce consequences
Connection between authority by expertise and by command

> A good leader should have expertise.

> However, expertise does not make you a leader automatically.

> Temptation: silence the critics of your expertise using your authority by command
Having authority?

> Authority is not something you have.

> Authority:
  — something you claim
  — acknowledged (or not) by others

> Or:
  — something ascribed to you
  — adopted (or not) by yourself
Acceptance and truth

> Authority needs acceptance.
> Authority by expertise is a criterion for acceptance.
> Authority by expertise is never a valid criterion for truth.
Fallibility

> Fallible does not mean you are wrong!
> Your statements are truth claims: not more, not less.
> Your office does not give you higher expertise – just higher responsibility.
> Fallibility implies that others are fallible, too.
> Never use your authority by command to silence your opponent. Instead, argue.
> Uneducated Christians without authority by expertise still have a primary knowledge of the faith.
> Abstention from exercising authority may enhance it.